## Contents

*Preface* xix  
*Acknowledgments* xxiii  
*Special Notice* xxvii

### Part One  
**Overview of Consumer Law**

1. **Assignment 1:** What Is Consumer Law?  
   A. Origins of Consumer Law  
      - *Carlill v. The Carbolic Smoke Ball Co.* 2  
   B. Consumer Law in the Modern Marketplace 8  
   C. Consumer Law Compared to Consumer Protection 10  
   D. Fields Related to Consumer Law 12  
   Problem Set 1 14

2. **Assignment 2:** Who Is a Consumer?  
   A. Definitions of Consumer  
      - *Houston Livestock Show and Rodeo, Inc. v. Hamrick* 19  
   B. Defining a Consumer Transaction  
      - *Gallegos v. Stokes* 23  
   C. Who Is Consumer Law Trying to Protect? 26  
   D. Special Categories of Consumers 27  
   Problem Set 2 29

3. **Assignment 3:** Who Makes Consumer Law?  
   A. Types of Law  
      1. Statutes 32  
      2. Regulations 34  
      3. Guidance/Commentary 35  
      4. Case Law 35  
   B. Federal Government  
      1. Federal Trade Commission 36  
      2. Consumer Financial Protection Bureau 37  
      3. Other Regulators 39  
   C. State and Local Government as Lawmakers 39  
      1. Attorneys General 39  
      2. State Banking Regulators 40  
      3. City Government 40  
   D. Preemption 41
Part Two
Consumer Meets Business: Getting Into the Deal

Assignment 4: Solicitations
A. In-Home Solicitations
   *Pinnacle Energy, L.L.C. v. Price*
B. Telephone Solicitations
   1. Telemarketing Fraud
   2. Do-not-call List
      *Mainstream Marketing Services, Inc. v. Federal Trade Commission*
C. Email Solicitations
D. Referral Schemes and Other Solicitation Techniques

Assignment 5: Advertising
A. Unfair and Deceptive Advertising
   1. False Advertising
      *State of Iowa, ex rel. Miller, Attorney General of Iowa v. Pace*
      *Kraft, Inc. v. Federal Trade Commission*
   2. Bait and Switch
B. Commercial Speech
   1. Constitutional Standard
   2. Forced Speech
C. Credit Advertising

Assignment 6: Consumer Privacy and Identity Theft
A. The General Approach to Consumer Privacy
   *In re JetBlue Airways Corp. Privacy Litigation*
B. Big Data
C. Consumer Privacy with Financial Institutions
D. Identity Theft
   *Andrews v. TRW*

Assignment 7: Credit Reporting
A. Content of Consumer Reports
   1. Types of Reports
   2. Data Collected
B. Uses of Credit Reports
   1. Credit
   2. Insurance
   3. Employment
      *Kelchner v. Sycamore Manor Health Center*
C. Decisions Based on Reports  115
   1. Adverse Action Defined  115
      *Safeco Insurance Co. of America et al. v. Burr et al.*  116
   2. Duties if Adverse Action Is Taken  123
D. Accuracy in Credit Reporting  123
   1. Detecting Errors  123
   2. Disputing Information  126
   3. Credit Repair  128
E. Enforcement for FCRA Violations  128
Problem Set 7  129

**Assignment 8:** Credit Discrimination  
A. History of Credit Discrimination  131
B. Prohibited Bases of Discrimination  132
   1. Sex or Gender  133
      *Markham v. Colonial Mortgage Serv. Co.*  133
   2. Race and Color  137
   3. National Origin  137
   4. Other Bases  138
C. Credit Process  139
   1. Applications  139
   2. Evaluations  139
   3. Data Collection  140
D. Proving Liability  141
   1. Disparate Treatment  142
   2. Disparate Impact  142
      *Tex. Dep’t of Housing and Community Affairs, et al. v. The Inclusive Communities Project, Inc., et al.*  142
E. Adverse Action and Data Collection  151
   1. General Notices  151
   2. Adverse Action Notices  152
      *Williams v. MBNA America Bank, N.A.*  153
Problem Set 8  157

**Part Three**
**Doing the Deal: Terms and Financing**  159

**Assignment 9:** Unfair or Deceptive Acts or Practices  159
A. Common Law Actions  159
B. Federal Unfair and Deceptive Acts and Practices Laws  160
   1. Federal Trade Commission’s UDAP Statute  160
   2. CFPB’s UDAAP Statute  162
C. State UDAP Laws  164
      *Rhonda Bosland v. Warnock Dodge, Inc.*  165
D. UDAP in Context  171
   1. Landlord-Tenant Law  172
      *Pierce v. Reichard*  172
   2. Unauthorized Practice of Law  174
      *Sussman v. Grado*  174
3. Towing Practices 176  
   *Waters v. Hollie* 176
4. Mouse-Trapping on Internet 177

**Problem Set 9** 178

**Assignment 10:** Warranties 181

A. Uniform Commercial Code 181
   1. Express Warranties 182  
      *Sanders v. Apple Inc.* 182
   2. Implied Warranties 187
B. Magnuson-Moss Warranty Act 188  
   *Smith v. LG Electronics USA, Inc.* 189
C. Statutory Warranties 196  
   *Milicević v. Fletcher Jones Imports, LTD* 197

**Problem Set 10** 201

**Assignment 11:** Usury 204

A. Historical and Comparative Contexts of Usury 204
B. State Statutes 205  
   *Citibank (South Dakota), N.A. v. Rosemary Walker DeCristoforo* 206
C. Federal Law 213
D. Usury as Economic and Social Policy 215

**Problem Set 11** 217

**Assignment 12:** Credit Cost Disclosures 218

A. Basic Concepts in Truth in Lending 218
   1. The Finance Charge 219  
      *Household Credit Servs. v. Pfenning* 220
   2. Amount Financed 225
   3. Annual Percentage Rate 225
B. Distinguishing Closed-End Credit and Open-End Credit 226
C. Disclosure Design and Delivery 227  
   *Smith v. Cash Store Mgmt., Inc.* 228

**Problem Set 12** 236

**Assignment 13:** Home Purchases 244

A. Anatomy of a Home Purchase 245
   1. Qualifying for a Mortgage 245  
      *Horiike v. Coldwell Banker Residential Brokerage Co.* 247
   2. Closing on a Home 252
   3. Housing Finance System 255
B. Liability for Homes 258
   1. Caveat Emptor 258  
      *Douglas v. Visser* 258
   2. Warranties on New Property 263  
      *Davencourt at Pilgrims Landing Homeowners Ass’n v. Davencourt at Pilgrims Landing LC* 264
   3. Manufactured/Mobile Homes 268

**Problem Set 13** 269
Contents

Assignment 14: Home Mortgages 272
A. Making Mortgage Loans 272
1. Underwriting the Loan (QM) 274
2. Special Rules for High-Cost Mortgages (HOEPA) 276
   Bishop v. Quicken Loans, Inc. 276
3. Creditor Defenses and Borrower Liability 285
B. Mortgage Servicing 285
1. Payment Collection 286
2. Default and Loss Mitigation 287
   Valbuena v. Ocwen Loan Servicing, LLC 289
3. Rescission 293
   Paatalo v. JPMorgan Chase Bank 293
Problem Set 14 297

Assignment 15: Credit Cards 299
A. Credit Card Transactions 299
B. Limitations on Fees and Other Product Terms 301
   1. Late Fees and Other Penalty Fees 301
   2. Rate Changes 303
C. Defenses to Liability for Charges 304
   1. Claims Against Merchants 304
   2. Unauthorized Charges 305
      Crestar Bank, N.A. v. Cheevers 305
D. Payments from Consumers 310
Problem Set 15 312

Assignment 16: Automobile Transactions 314
A. Automobile Sales 315
   1. Odometer Laws 315
      Owens v. Samkle Automotive Inc. 315
   2. Lemon Laws 320
B. Automobile Financing 321
   1. Dealer Reserves 321
      Beaudreau v. Larry Hill Pontiac 322
   2. Loan Packing 330
   3. Leases 330
C. Title Loans 331
Problem Set 16 333

Assignment 17: Payday Loans 335
A. Payday Loan Industry 335
B. Regulatory Approaches to Payday Loans 336
   Quik Payday, Inc. v. Stork 337
   1. Disclosure Requirements 344
   2. Limits on Interest Rates and Costs 345
   3. Limits on Numbers of Transactions 345
   4. Bans on Payday Lending 346
C. Policy Debates on Payday Lending 348
   1. Product Substitution 348
2. Relationship of Payday Lending to Financial Distress 349
3. Regulatory Arbitrage 350
Problem Set 17 350

Assignment 18: Student Loans 353

A. Federal Student Loans 354
   1. Types of Federal Student Assistance 354
   2. Loan Limits, Interest Rates, Fees, and Disclosures 355
   3. Postponing Repayment 357
   4. Servicing 358
   5. Repayment Programs 359
B. Private Student Loans 360
   1. Disclosures 361
   2. Repayment 361
C. Default 361
   1. Collections 362
      Bible v. United Student Aid Funds, Inc. 363
D. Discharging Student Loans 374
   1. Statutory Discharge 374
   2. Bankruptcy 375
E. For-Profit Schools 376
   1. Scholarship Scams and Diploma Mills 376
   2. Government Discharge and Reimbursement Programs for School Misconduct 376
   3. Legal Claims 377

Problem Set 18 378

Assignment 19: Banking Transactions 380

A. Bank Accounts 380
   1. Checking Accounts 381
      Marx v. Whitney Nat’l Bank 383
      In re Burrier 387
   2. Account Disclosures 395
   3. Account Access 396
B. Electronic Funds Transfer Act 397
   1. Debit Cards 397
   2. ACH and Bill Pay Systems 398
C. Other Payment Transactions 399
   1. Money Orders and Remittances 400
   2. Stored Value or Prepaid Cards 400
   3. Mobile Payments 402

Problem Set 19 403

Assignment 20: Online Transactions 405

A. Contracting Online 405
   Fteja v. Facebook, Inc. 406
B. Shopping Online 412
C. Marketing Online 414
D. Digital Applications 416
   In re Apple In-App Purchase Litig. 417
Problem Set 20 422

Part Four
The Deal Goes Awry: Enforcement 425

Assignment 21: Creditor Remedies 425
A. Collecting Unsecured Debts 426
   1. Lawsuits 426
   2. Execution and Garnishment 427
      Credit Bureau of Broken Bow, Inc. v. Moninger 428
B. Collecting Secured Debts 430
   1. Repossession 430
   2. Foreclosure 432
C. Protection from Debtor Suit 435
   1. Holder in Due Course Doctrine 435
   2. FTC Preservation Rule 436
      Deutsche Bank National Trs. Co. v. Carmichael (In re Carmichael) 437
Problem Set 21 443

Assignment 22: Debtor Rights 445
A. FTC Credit Practices Rule 445
   F.T.C. v. Loanpointe 446
B. Exemptions 453
   1. Property Exemptions 453
   2. Wage Exemptions 453
      J.M. v. Hobbs 454
C. Consumer Bankruptcy 458
   Mitchell v. BankIllinois (In re Mitchell) 458
Problem Set 22 467

Assignment 23: Debt Collection Abuses 469
A. Prohibited Acts 469
   Bingham v. Collection Bureau, Inc. 470
B. Scope of FDCPA 476
   Dickman v. Kimball, Tirey & St. John, LLP 477
C. State Debt Collection Laws 482
   Finley v. Dynamic Recovery Solutions LLC 482
D. Debt Buyers 487
E. Debt Settlement or Consolidation 489
Problem Set 23 490

Assignment 24: Public Enforcement 492
A. Federal Actors: CFPB and FTC 492
   Consumer Financial Protection Bureau v. ITT Educational Services, Inc. 493
B. State Attorneys General

West Virginia v. CVS Pharmacy, Inc.

Problem Set 24

Assignment 25: Private Enforcement

A. Litigation Remedies
1. Actual Damages
   McGrady v. Nissan Motor Acceptance Corp
2. Statutory Damages
3. Other Relief

B. Litigation Barriers
   Sheffer v. Experian Information Solutions, Inc.

C. Class Actions
D. Non-Enforcement

Problem Set 25

Assignment 26: Alternative Dispute Resolution

A. Arbitration and Its Premises
B. Invalidating or Limiting Arbitration in Consumer Contracts
   1. Unconscionability and State Law
      AT&T Mobility LLC v. Concepcion
   2. Statutory or Other Prohibitions
C. Evaluating Arbitration
   1. Arguments for Arbitration
   2. Arguments Against Arbitration
   3. Barriers to Effective Evaluation

Problem Set 26

Part Five

Consumer Law Policymaking

Assignment 27: The Future of Consumer Law

A. Future Money
   1. Bitcoin
   2. Digital Fiat
   3. Consumer Protection Issues
B. Digital Media: Video Games
   1. Intangible Digital “Goods”
   2. Legal Framework
   3. Consumer Protection Issues
C. Socialization of Finance
   1. Crowdfunding
   2. Peer to Peer Lending
   3. Consumer Protection Issues
D. Conclusion

Problem Set 27

Table of Cases
Index
Preface

Consumer law is incredibly complex, despite its applicability to millions of people engaged in everyday transactions. The complexity is reflected both in the law itself and in the challenges of trying to teach and learn consumer law. Consumer law has porous boundaries and comes from multiple sources rather than a single lawmaker or an integrated statutory code. Because consumer law is diffuse, many lawyers may practice in this area but not explicitly identify as “consumer lawyers.” Anyone who represents individual people in civil cases, however, will find many client problems that arise from consumer transactions, and the demand from consumers for legal help greatly overwhelms the supply of knowledgeable lawyers. From the other side, nearly any business that sells goods or services to individuals will face consumer law issues with compliance and litigation.

Consumer law is rapidly growing in importance. A 2013 poll of professors found that consumer law ranked first as the area of law deserving more attention in the legal academy, beating out hot topics such as immigration law, energy law, and alternative dispute resolution. See Brian Leiter’s Law School Reports blog, Apr. 18, 2013 at http://tinyurl.com/k3d7p4a. While law schools need to ramp up offerings in consumer law, the legal system and economy are more concerned with consumer issues now than at any time since the 1970s. The Dodd-Frank Wall Street Reform and Consumer Protection Act of 2010 contained sweeping law reforms and rearranged the very structure of consumer regulation. It created a Consumer Financial Protection Bureau to administer most federal consumer laws governing credit. This change reflects the unprecedented levels of household borrowing in the last twenty years and the importance of consumer spending to the overall economy. Because consumer law governs these purchases and loans, it has grown in size and complexity in tandem with its economic importance.

This book tackles the challenges of consumer law with a three-prong approach. First, it situates consumer law within the business law curriculum. At first this may seem counterintuitive, and of course, many who represent consumers do so in roles as government lawyers, legal services lawyers, or poverty lawyers. But consumer transactions, by definition, also involve businesses. Indeed, it is this consumer-to-business nature of the transaction that gives rise to the impetus for most consumer law. When businesses purchase property, goods, or services from each other (for example, a retailer that buys inventory from a wholesaler), consumer laws do not apply. Consumer law governs, however, when that retailer goes to sell the inventory in the form of goods on a shelf to a consumer. From this perspective, consumer law can be understood as the legal system’s effort to address the disparities in sophistication and power that typically exist between consumers and businesses.

This book is built around the fact that consumer law is big business — both for lawyers and for the economy in general. The book reflects this “consumer
law as business law” philosophy in its content and its pedagogy. It spends time explaining the economics and business structure of many consumer transactions. It seeks to explore and explain the relevant market: How are these deals structured? Who makes money? Is the market competitive or constrained? How does information flow in the market? In its pedagogical approach, the book refrains from assuming the student shares the normative perspective of a consumer. The problems often ask students to advise businesses on the compliance issues or litigation risks created by consumer law, as well as advocate for a beleaguered consumer. This tactic recognizes that the world of consumer practice offers opportunities for lawyers to represent consumers (as government lawyers, policy advocates, and plaintiffs’ attorneys) and to represent businesses (as in-house counsel, defense attorneys, and lobbyists).

Second, this book attempts to give consumer law a sharp theoretical framework by situating it at the intersection of contract and tort. Consumer law is more than a collection of laws with the word “consumer” in them. It is, as suggested above, the law’s response to the failures of traditional law to achieve satisfactory outcomes in consumer-business transactions. The book repeatedly returns to the doctrines of fraud (from tort law) and unconscionability (from contract law) to see how the common law in these areas has been reshaped by statutes and regulations. These newer forms of law typically provide more protection for consumers and impose more duties on businesses than under the common law. Consumer law is an ideal place to expand on the first-year law school curriculum, adding skills in statutory analysis, administrative law, and policymaking to the student’s toolkit. The book also attempts to show the artificiality of a public law/private law divide. It highlights the way in which private transactions have public effects, and conversely how public goals find their way into laws that inhibit or limit private deals.

The third approach of the book to teaching consumer law is to be avowedly social scientific in its approach. In this regard, the book marshals the existing empirical research on topics related to consumer law such as financial literacy, household finance, and the legal profession. It also points out where important knowledge is missing and asks how such data could be obtained. Law is neither practiced nor made in a vacuum; the book reflects the belief that well-equipped lawyers are comfortable with a broad range of social science including psychology, marketing, sociology, and economics. The social science approach repeatedly turns to the gap between the law as written and the law as experienced, asking questions about the value of a law that remains unused or underenforced and the ways in which lawyers and courts struggle to engage successfully with consumers who lack legal knowledge. Of course, such problems plague many other areas of law but are predominant in consumer law.

These three characteristics of this book lead to a “casebook” that is quite far from the traditional law text. In fact, the book contains relatively few cases as compared to the amount of expository text. The text allows students to focus on the statutes and regulations that are the heart of modern consumer law. It also mirrors the reality that case law often does not exist on a particular point or is of little importance to a business lawyer or consumer lawyer trying to
design a litigation strategy sharply constrained by reputational risks (business) or financial limits on affording counsel (consumer). The book’s cases illustrate the factual context of the transactions as much as they teach the dispositive law. The book also uses rules, legislative history, research studies, websites, videos, and even things like cartoons and newspaper stories to teach consumer law. Part of the justification for this is that consumers themselves are likely to learn about their rights from these sources, rather than from published case law. The text tries to be explanatory in tone. As stated in this preface’s first sentence, consumer law is hard. This book outlines the basic law and provides opportunities for using the core legal competencies of reading and analyzing law to see how the law applies in context.

The book is designed to be taught using a strong form of the problem-method. Unlike the questions following cases in a traditional text, the problems are not to be skimmed and treated as rhetorical. The problems are to be read, analyzed, worked, and “solved” to the best of students’ abilities before class. The problems take several typical forms. These include: 1) statute readers that highlight key points or ambiguities in the law itself; 2) transactional problems that pose questions of compliance, planning, and client counseling; 3) theoretical puzzlers that push on the persistent difficulties of consumer law as a legal subject; and 4) policy problems that require identifying the social, economic, and political issues at play in consumer lawmaking. The problems are fact-specific and contextual. This means that as in real life, some problems have clear answers and others are ambiguous. Some problems intentionally omit key facts because limited information is a real problem in lawyering. Other problems reflect that a half-victory or partial solution is often the only outcome, asking students to identify the limitations to a more comprehensive resolution.

This book’s coverage is selective. It focuses on several major aspects of transactions: getting into a transaction, the substantive terms of the transactions, and enforcement if the transaction goes awry. It does not cover all the substantive goods, services, or property that consumers buy or all the types of financial products used in these transactions but instead selects certain products as emblematic of different approaches to consumer law. The intuition is that consumers and businesses face similar information and power disparities across transactions. Once students see how consumer law grapples with these issues in a particular context, they can identify similar problems and solutions in other areas. This approach has particular merit in consumer law, where the scams and frauds of today are regulated or litigated out of existence only to be replaced with new scams and frauds. Underneath activities ranging from advertising cold remedies to creating digital currency, the fundamental problems of consumer law remain. What is the appropriate amount of intervention in the market? How much should the law expect consumers to protect themselves? When is the burden on business so great that it creates economic hardships that outweigh the social benefits of regulations?

This book is organized into five major parts. It opens by asking some basic questions about the nature of consumer law. This part provides an opportunity to tackle the boundary problem of consumer law and to introduce students to the multiple origins of consumer law. The book gives heavy weight to federal consumer law but covers state law as applicable, doing so by focusing
on a particular jurisdiction to illustrate a typical approach. Part 2 focuses on
the initial contact between the consumer and business; it addresses issues
related to advertising, marketing, and access to credit. Part 3 considers the
terms of a consumer-business transaction in two ways. It begins with a
study of substantive limits on the sale of products and the extension of credit,
looking at issues like warranties, disclosure, and credit cost. Then, it looks in
depth with one or more assignments on each of several major consumer pro-
ducts: homes, automobiles, credit cards, student loans, etc. Part 4 of the book
studies the rights and remedies of creditors and debtors if the transaction does
not go as planned. It considers how the law balances enforcement of the con-
tracted-for bargain against protection of consumers. It also distinguishes
between the enforcement mechanisms used in consumer law such as private
litigation, public action, and alternate dispute methods. The final section,
Part 5, addresses consumer law policymaking by studying emerging topics
for consumer law.

Consumer law is sometimes derided as the law of small people and small
problems. In my view, this characterization is inaccurate. Consumers may be
“small” in their individual contexts, but their force in the economy and in
society is formidable. Being a consumer is one of the key ways that people
engage in the world. The ways in which the law allows consumers and busi-
ness to transact reflect core values about capitalism and democracy. Con-
sumer law is a fertile ground for examining normative principles about the
role of law in an economy and a society. I have found studying and shaping
consumer law to have many rewards and challenges. I hope this book inspires
you to identify and engage as a citizen and lawyer with consumer law issues.
Consumers and businesses will benefit from a new generation of those people
passionate about consumer law.

January 2016
Irvine, California

Katherine Porter